

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/281870073>

# “Pentecostalism in Singapore and Malaysia: Past, Present and Future,”

Chapter · January 2015

---

CITATIONS

0

READS

3,025

1 author:



Timothy T. N. Lim

London School of Theology

24 PUBLICATIONS 11 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:



Theological Methodology [View project](#)



Brill's Ecclesiology [View project](#)

## Chapter 12

### **Pentecostalism in Singapore and Malaysia: Past, Present, and Future**

*Timothy Lim T. N.*

This essay investigates the origins, growth, and future of Pentecostal and charismatic renewal in Singapore and Malaysia.<sup>1</sup> Historians trace the beginnings of the global Pentecostal movement to the Azusa Street Pentecostal Outpouring in 1901, even though discrepancies exist as to whether William Seymour or Charles Parham played more instrumental roles.<sup>2</sup> Revivals were reported in Pyongyang and at other locales between 1901 and 1910, and sometimes these are not traceable to the North American renewal movement.<sup>3</sup> Today's Pentecostalism represents a global cluster of movements that transform not just the unconverted but also Christians.<sup>4</sup> For this chapter, Pentecostalism includes various renewal streams (classical, neo-Pentecostals, charismatic, neo-charismatic, and third wavers) who share similar phenomenological experiences of the Spirit—Spirit baptism, *glossolalia*, operation of charismata, power encounters, healing, exorcism, and deliverance ministries—although each of these streams would nuance their history, theology, and practices. I will briefly introduce the history of Pentecostal and charismatic renewal in Malaysia and Singapore. Similar to the global Pentecostal narratives, Pentecostal and charismatic renewal in both countries have grown robustly amid experiences of plurality (ethnic, racial, and religious), intolerance, and sometimes, persecution. However, due to their respective sociopolitical contexts, Pentecostals and charismatics in Singapore and Malaysia developed in distinct ways, compared to each other and the West. Finally, I will examine the prospects and challenges in theology, faith formation, outreach, interreligious engagement, and social witnessing.

#### **Malaysia Pentecostalism: Brief History to Present**

From the 1930s the Spirit weaved His tapestry for Malaysian Pentecostalism in the Muslim Shari'ah law environment. The Malays in the peninsula encountered Nestorian settlements in the seventh century, Portuguese Catholicism and Dutch Reformed Presbyterianism between the fifteenth and seventeenth centuries, and centuries later, British Protestantism, Brethren, Evangelical Lutheran, and other missions.<sup>5</sup> From the 1970s, Pentecostalism grew rapidly, and by the mid-1980s more than two-thirds of the evangelicals and mainliners were Pentecostals.<sup>6</sup> The leaders gained sociopolitical credibility. However, like the rest of Malaysian Christianity, Pentecostals continued to receive threats for their faith.

Jin Huat Tan traced four distinct developments of Pentecostal renewal in Malaysia: Indian Pentecostal developments, Chinese-speaking and English-speaking Assemblies of God (AOG), charismatic renewal among mainline churches, and indigenous renewals.<sup>7</sup> First, the Ceylon Pentecostal Mission (CPM) labored among migrant Indians and Sri Lankans at Ipoh in 1930. The ministry expanded to Port Dickson,

Kuala Lumpur, Teluk Anson, Penang, and other parts of the peninsula. CPM was registered as the Pentecostal Church of Malaya (PCM) in 1952, and today it has about fifteen hundred members, mostly Indians.<sup>8</sup> A recent source included Indian immigrants among the largest Pentecostal groups in Malaysia.<sup>9</sup> Some CPM congregations left and became Tamil-speaking AOG churches under the initiative of Chris Thomas, the first dean of the Bible Institute of Malaya, in 1968.

Second, Chinese churches blossomed after John Sung's revival meetings in the peninsula and Eastern Malaysia among Methodists and Presbyterians between 1935 and 1940. Observable Spirit-filled evidences included weeping, conviction of sins, conversions, consecrations for full-time Christian service, signs and wonders, singing short gospel choruses, and loud prayers. Chinese-speaking Assemblies of God (AOG), which was started in the Peninsular Malaysia in 1934, subsequently moved to Ampang and Padu in 1935. They became affiliated with AOG in the United States in 1940 and registered officially with Malaysian authorities in 1953. The first church building was erected at Jalan Sayer in 1955. AOG missionaries serving formative churches in China between the 1950s and 1960s also helped churches in Penang. Hong Kong actress Kong Duen Yee, who visited Penang in 1963, started her affiliation of churches known as New Testament Church after she preached at a series of meetings. Some folks who experienced Spirit baptism renewal under Yee's itinerant preaching later formed their own assemblies or congregations after their Brethren and other congregations ousted them. For instance, Brethren Elder Teh Phai Lian of Burmah Road Gospel Hall started the Church of Penang, which was later renamed Charismatic Church of Penang.

The third phase of development identified by Tan begins when former CPM members organized the English-speaking Assemblies of God (AOG) before the 1960s. These churches grew under David Baker and Lula Ashmoe Baird's parallel missionary efforts in China. They branched out from Penang to Ipoh, Taiping (Aulong villages), and Kuala Lumpur. Twenty youths attended a 1957 Youth Camp at Port Dickson and were baptized in the Spirit. To cope with the Pentecostal growth in Malaysia and Southeast Asia, the Bible Institute of Malaysia (later renamed, Bible College of Malaysia) was founded in 1960. The institute trained AOG pastors for church planting, evangelism, and pioneering work between 1960 and 1980.<sup>10</sup> By 1970 nearly every town in West Malaysia had an AOG church, and interestingly they used the Navigators' materials to disciple students, 80 percent of whom were Chinese.

Between the 1970s and mid-1980s AOG membership surged after three hundred youths were expelled from mainline churches in Klang Valley because of their charismatic experience. As the charismatic renewal was not supported by mainline denominations, many young enthusiasts left their churches to start either AOG churches or new independent charismatic churches. Examples included the Tabernacle of Glory in 1974 and the Latter Rain Church in 1975, each becoming bridgeheads for church plants throughout Malaysia. Calvary Charismatic Centre gathered in 1978 for mainline members who were uncomfortable with attending AOG churches. Renewal Lutheran Church began Deeper Life Seminars in the 1980s, and organized other gatherings such as The Word Center and New Life Restoration Center. Various businessmen and leaders from various denominations (Brethren, Roman Catholic nuns) formed The Full Gospel Assembly, Kuala Lumpur in 1981, and it later became affiliated with the Full Gospel Businessmen Fellowship International.

Charismatic renewal varied in the 1980s and 1990s. In 1982 South Korean pastor Paul Yonggi Cho conducted a church growth seminar in Singapore.<sup>11</sup> Thereafter, Malaysian AOG leaders who attended the seminar began initiatives toward urban outreach and conceiving megachurches. Thousand-member churches emerged, such as Glad Tidings and Grace Assembly in Klang Valley. The prosperity theology became a mainstay with Abundant Life Center's invitation to American charismatic faith healer T. L. Osborn. Emphases included faith healing and deliverance ministries, adding to teachings on the baptism of the Holy Spirit and speaking in tongues.

The prophetic movement emphasizing personal prophecies fell on older and newer charismatic churches from the 1980s. The prophetic wave also entered some mainline churches. Leaders like Rev. Peter Young of St. Gabriel's (Anglican) Church (also leader of Scripture Union) experienced renewal despite reservations by mainline denominational leaders and reaction from cessationistic and dispensational evangelical Brethren churches.<sup>12</sup> St. Gabriel's Church became a point-church, organizing charismatic renewal meetings and collaborating with All Saints' Church and Christ Lutheran Church, Setapak. Young's influence as an evangelical leader with Scripture Union's network of churches helped evangelical and mainline churches to receive Pentecostal and charismatic renewal amid their critics. A series of joint seminars at Trinity Methodist Church, Petaling Jaya, featuring both Baptist Douglas McBain and Benedictine priest Ian Petit, was supported by the Anglican, Baptist, Brethren, Evangelical Free, Lutheran, Methodist, Pentecostal, and Roman Catholic churches.

A proliferation of prophetic ministries characterized Malaysian Pentecostal/charismatic renewal in the 1980s and 1990s. Still, notable leaders, including Revs. Peter Tan (now known as Johann Melchizedek Peter), Paul Ang, and David Wong Kim, all delivered accurate prophetic words and became popular Bible teachers among churches in Malaysia, Singapore, and Indonesia.<sup>13</sup> These ministers formerly served together at the Tabernacle of Glory. However, moral scandals in Peter Tan's ministry led to his migration to Australia. Consequently, many "prophets" or "ministers who moved in the prophetic" left Tabernacle of Glory.<sup>14</sup> The prophetic movement renewed many churches until the wider prophetic movement (though not a result of Paul Ang or David Wong Kim's impeccable services) was questioned, especially after the demise of the Anglican bishop of West Malaysia Tan Sri John Gurubatham Savarimuthu in 1994; the Anglican bishop was prophesized to have a long life and ministry amid his illness, but he died shortly afterward.

By 2000 there were 291 English-speaking AOG churches throughout Malaysia. Newer churches, such as Renewal Lutheran Church and Damansara Utama Methodist Church, experimented with music and performing arts in their outreach to youths (without the approval of AOG Leadership/Council in the late 1990s and 2000s): they mirrored Scripture Union's musical rallies around the country from 1975–1979.

Tan's final phase starts with the indigenous Pentecostal revival among the Kelabits in 1973, which led to several contextual expressions and Spirit outpouring among secondary school students in Sarawak. These expressions became the Sidang Injil Borneo, which was originally founded by Borneo Evangelical Mission.<sup>15</sup> Crusades with Indonesian evangelist Petrus Octavianus were instrumental in indigenization efforts. Prayer movements developed at Bario in 1979, and revival meetings were organized at Ba Kelalan in 1981–1985.<sup>16</sup> Other initiatives were the planting of indigenous Chinese

Pentecostal congregations, such as MengfuJiaohui (Blessed Church, Kuching), and local worship or gospel song productions in Sarawak.<sup>17</sup> Pentecostal and charismatic phenomena, altar calls, deliverance, and healing ministries were reported in the Anglican Church of Sabah.<sup>18</sup>

Pentecostals and charismatics have increased their influence with Malaysian Christianity and politics. I will mention an example. In the 2000s the National Evangelical Christian Fellowship Malaysia (NECF) was a critical mediatory agency among its network of churches. Pentecostals in NECF network included Assembly of God, Full Gospel Assembly, Full Gospel Tabernacle, and Latter Rain Church.<sup>19</sup> The then NECF Secretary General, Rev. Dr. David Wong Kim Kong, was a widely respected Pentecostal leader and had been instrumental in reconciling conflicts between Pentecostal and non-Pentecostal evangelical churches. One of his initiatives (Malaysian CARE) before he joined NECF became a primary collaborative project for churches to express social concern of the church.<sup>20</sup> He was conferred “The Most Distinguished Order of Chivalry” (Johan Mangku Negara) by the Malaysian prime minister and was regularly invited to advise interreligious affairs in states and in the political structures of the nation. Despite his critics,<sup>21</sup> he has been serving as principal consultant of the Leadership Training Academy since his retirement from NECF.<sup>22</sup>

Threats continue to affect Malaysian Christianity. The Pentecostal/charismatic movement is not spared. For instance, fringe groups bombed the Metro Tabernacle Church because its senior pastor, Rev. Ong Sek Leong (also, general superintendent of AOG of Malaysia), was the chairman of the 23rd Pentecostal World Conference, Kuala Lumpur, held in June 2013.<sup>23</sup> Churches in Malaysia face persecution periodically due to non-Christian religious pressures. A church retreat center near Tapah was raided in January 2001, and the Bible Society of Malaysia was raided by Selangor Islamic authorities, JAIS (Jabatan Agama Islam Selangor).<sup>24</sup>

### **Singapore Pentecostalism: Brief History to Present**

From the beginning, Singapore Pentecostalism and charismaticism contended with the largely evangelical Protestant presence, along with the near century-old Catholic and Anglican missions in the land.<sup>25</sup> It attracted Christians seeking renewal. The robustness appealed to younger generations who were seeking self-identity and success in an affluent society. Creative ways of harbingering for plurality, prosperity, and outreach have characterized the LoveSingapore network of churches.<sup>26</sup>

Singapore Pentecostal/charismatic renewal historiography developed in several phases.<sup>27</sup> First is Western influences traced to Assemblies of God missionary efforts and Finnish Pentecostal mission. After AG missionaries Rev. Cecil and Edith Jackson were expelled from Mainland China in 1928, they labored with the Cantonese community in Singapore and started a school for children in Balestier in 1929. Missionaries, including Rev. Lawrence McKinney, joined them to reach English-speaking Singaporeans in 1932. The newly formed group split, with McKinney starting Elim Church and the rest becoming independent Pentecostal gatherings before the Japanese occupation (1942–1945). Between 1947 and 1960 other missionaries established five other AG churches.<sup>28</sup> In 1958 seven Pentecostal churches and an independent church collaborated to organize a two-week salvation-healing crusade, which extended for another three weeks. Finnish Free Foreign Mission of the Pentecostal Churches of Finland planted several churches:

Zion Centre (renamed, Zion Full Gospel Church) in 1949, Glad Tidings Church in 1957, and two other independent congregations.

Second are Asian influences traced to the positive reception of John Sung's revival meetings, and especially Hong Kong actress Kong Duen Yee's itinerant ministry in 1963. Christians from the Brethren tradition who received the renewal experience were not allowed back in their churches. These newly Spirit-baptized believers, including the late Elder Goh Ewe Kheng of the Brethren Assembly, formed a nucleus of churches, which became the Church of Singapore.<sup>29</sup> Elder Goh chaired the Evangelical Fellowship of Singapore (EFS) in the mid-1990s and led a number of evangelicals into the Pentecostal renewal. He was chairman emeritus of Ting Ling Bible School and an elder of the Church of Singapore.<sup>30</sup>

Third, the late 1970s to mid-1980s saw signs of vibrant charismatic renewal among some mainline Protestants (Anglicans, Lutherans, Methodists, and Presbyterians), free-church believers and evangelicals (e.g., Baptists, Evangelical Free, and Brethren churches), and Roman Catholics.<sup>31</sup> The Full Gospel Businessmen Fellowship in Singapore was formed in 1972; they organized the Spiritual Renewal Fellowship in 1974 for Pentecostals and charismatics who had experienced the renewal, and was reorganized in 1975 to welcome other professionals.<sup>32</sup> In 1985 Emeritus Bishop Doraisamy of The Methodist Church in Singapore attributed its decade of church growth and membership to the influence of the charismatic renewal.<sup>33</sup> Pentecostal significance for the Methodism was affirmed recently by one of its theologians, Dr. Roland Chia.<sup>34</sup>

A fourth phase was initiated in the late 1970s when Rev. Chiu Ban It, the sixth Anglican Bishop of Singapore cum Chair of Scripture Union, Singapore, became a charismatic after reading American Anglican clergy Dennis Bennett's *Nine O'Clock in the Morning*.<sup>35</sup> The renewal movement received impetus for growth under Bishop Chiu and Bishop Moses Tay (who became archbishop of the province of Anglican Church in Southeast Asia).<sup>36</sup> The unparalleled Pentecostal and charismatic deliverance ministry of the Church of Our Saviour, under the leadership of Senior Pastor Rev. Derek Hong, was and is still a shining example of renewal in an Anglican congregation.<sup>37</sup> With his bishops' blessings, Rev. Canon Dr. James Wong played an instrumental role as founder-president of the annual Festival of Praise, which gathered churches from various denominations, including the charismatic LoveSingapore movement since 1986.<sup>38</sup> However, the Anglican embrace of Spirit-filled renewal cooled off during immediate past Bishop John Chew's time.<sup>39</sup> Prospects for Pentecostal/charismatic renewal in Singapore Anglicanism have yet to be a significant statement since the present bishopric of the Rt. Rev. Rennis Ponniah.

Among the fifteen Brethren churches in Singapore, Living Sanctuary Brethren Church (LSBC) and Bethesda Bedok-Tampines Church (BBTC) are shining examples of the charismatic renewal.<sup>40</sup> The two churches not only maintained fellowship with other Brethren churches, but they have also brought the autonomously run Brethren or Bethesda churches together under the Brethren Network Fellowship, Singapore. LSBC stood out as a community outreach church with its community penetration (CP) program.

In the Catholic Church, the charismatic renewal began with a prayer meeting led by Edmund Ang in the Church of the Nativity of the Blessed Virgin Mary (abbreviated, Nativity Church) in 1979.<sup>41</sup> Nativity Church members founded the Chinese Charismatic Renewal in 1995 and introduced the renewal to the Church of St. Anne in 2006; renewal in St. Anne is now called the Burning Bush Charismatic Prayer Group.<sup>42</sup> There are

perhaps other Catholic renewal developments in Singapore that are not reported. Ambivalence between Catholics and evangelical Protestants remains in the churches' consciousness despite the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Singapore's membership with the National Council of Churches of Singapore and the presence of the Archdiocesan Catholic Council for Ecumenical Dialogue (ACCED), which is led by Rev. Msgr. Philip Heng, SJ.<sup>43</sup> The first joint healing service was attended by five hundred Catholics and Protestants at Aldersgate Methodist Church on October 6, 2014, and was graced by Catholic Archbishop William Goh, Methodist Bishop Dr. Wee Boon Hup, and Lutheran Bishop Terry Kee.<sup>44</sup>

A further, fifth phase might include when some independent charismatic churches that emerged from the charismatic renewal in the mid- to late 1980s grew to become megachurches, especially since the 2000s. New Creation Church, which started under Rev. Henry Yeo, transited its leadership to Senior Pastor Joseph Prince and reported twenty-four thousand members in 2014.<sup>45</sup> It owns a state-of-the-art theater-seating worship auditorium and several businesses—Daystar Child Development Centre, Rock Productions (including their now expired acquisition, Marine Cove, previously East Coast Park Recreation Centre), and Omega Tours and Travel.<sup>46</sup> A few years before New Creation Church more than doubled its membership, Faith Community Baptist Church (FCBC) was the largest church in Singapore. FCBC's senior pastor Rev. Lawrence Khong's illusions-magic ministry for outreach (since 2001 and MagicBox production in 2008),<sup>47</sup> sociopolitical statements supporting Singapore's penal code on criminalizing queer lifestyle (in 2013),<sup>48</sup> among other nonconventional initiatives, resulted in some three thousand members leaving the church; nonetheless, FCBC remained ten thousand strong.<sup>49</sup> Khong remains seen as the Singapore coordinator for the Spiritual Warfare Network, first appointed by C. Peter Wagner at the International Spiritual Warfare Network Consultation in Seoul, Korea, in 1993.<sup>50</sup> City Harvest Church (CHC)'s former senior pastor Rev. Kong Hee, along with five church leaders, still faces allegations for redirecting church funds meant for a new church building to support of their co-pastor Sun Ho's music career as their outreach in the performing arts industry; CHC had nearly twenty thousand members in 2012 before the controversy.<sup>51</sup> Other congregations such as the seven-thousand-member Trinity Christian Centre, the one-thousand-member Cornerstone Church (which sought accountability with Zion Fellowship International from Waverly, New York), and the year-2000-inaugurated RiverLife Church of two thousand members add to the local renewal expressions.

Finally, more recently, some Malaysian Pentecostals have crossed the border of the peninsula to start a College of Prophets for River of Life Ministries (distinguished from RiverLife Church, Singapore).<sup>52</sup> They joined the prophetic call of Singapore Christianity's "Antioch of Asia" status, which has been affected for decades by many evangelical missional para-church organizations, and the annual trans-denominational GoForth Conference among the churches and para-church organizations, coordinated by Singapore Centre for Global Missions (SCGM, previously known as Singapore Centre for Evangelism and Missions, SCEM).<sup>53</sup>

The interreligious and intra-religious engagement in Singapore, unlike the Malaysian Shari'ah Law arrangement, is governed by a statute, Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act (approved March 31, 1992, and revised July 31, 2011).<sup>54</sup> Together with the Interreligious Confidence Circle (IRCC) operating in the country's electoral

constituencies, “the government plays an active but limited role in religious affairs, including efforts to promote religious harmony and toleration.”<sup>55</sup> With this backdrop, Pentecostal and charismatic churches negotiate in the public spaces and creatively express their faith, thereby transforming religious discourses and practices and generating new forms of identification with global renewal movements.<sup>56</sup> Pentecostal/charismatic public engagement, however, did not lead the Singapore churches’ public witness; the burden fell on the National Council of Churches, Singapore, and its collaboration with Trinity Theological College, Singapore.<sup>57</sup> One author calls these ranges of development “filling the moral void.”<sup>58</sup> Megachurches operate unique social and community outreach programs, some of which are on a national scale, and in collaboration with non-Pentecostal non-charismatic Protestant churches in and across various constituencies. Other events are more spiritually geared, such as the multi-tiered events of the nearly two-and-a-half-decade-old LoveSingapore movement, which included the iconic year 2000 annual prayer walks that at its peak drew more than sixty thousand believers from hundreds of churches, not forgetting that the LoveSingapore also brought together 120 churches and leaders—Pentecostal, charismatic, Evangelical Free, and other Protestant—that was unprecedented before the recent decade of GoForth efforts.<sup>59</sup>

Few can disregard the Spirit-empowered mission of renewal in Singapore even though its critics remain vocal, and these critics indirectly ensured the accountability of the churches in the secular, civil, and public square. Dominant critics in recent years include challenges to the prosperity theology teachings.<sup>60</sup> Controversies arose from City Harvest Church and Faith Community Baptist Church, and to a lesser extent, the “extreme-grace” and highly remunerated pastors of New Creation Church or the intended “takeover” of Association of Women Action and Research (AWARE) by Church of Our Saviour. Proselytization and scandals among churches in Singapore that caught the attention of the public and media seem to stem mostly from independent charismatic churches.<sup>61</sup> Some critics include fundamental churches that continue to decry the “apostasy” of charismatic renewal.<sup>62</sup> Even AG theologian Simon Chan critiqued Pentecostal/charismatic expressions, especially LoveSingapore, as “not deeply rooted in scripture or the Christian tradition, but in pragmatism,” being one “very much conditioned by the prevailing culture.”<sup>63</sup> And in addition to the handful of more established interdenominational or union seminaries, Pentecostals have few Bible colleges, seminaries, and nonconventional colleges that support the development of its leaders: Asia Theological Center (formerly, Asia Theological Centre for Evangelism and Missions), Assemblies of God Bible College (formerly, Bible Institute of Singapore), TCA College (formerly, Theological College of Asia), and Tung Ling Bible School. These are among the vibrant claims to Holy Spirit movements in Singapore.<sup>64</sup> The pneumatological vibrancy led Baptist scholar Johnson T. K. Lim to initiate a multidisciplinary conversation among sixty-six international scholars on the Holy Spirit (2015) and in relations to hermeneutics, the Bible, the church, Christian living, Christian witness, ministry, preachers, and theologians of the Spirit, and a range of pneumatological issues, intended for a trans-denominational lay-readership.<sup>65</sup>

### **Prospects Amid Challenges**

Exciting prospects await Singaporean and Malaysian churches amid challenges in theology, faith formation, outreach, interreligious engagement, and social witnessing. The unknown is whether churches can renegotiate “spaces” for the future. Like the rest of the

religions in Asia, Pentecostalism has to construct and negotiate its platform, reform its movement to adjust to shifting sociocultural dimensions and values, and contextualize sensitively in a land of religious, cultural, ethnic, and socioeconomic pluralities.<sup>66</sup>

### **Theology**

In the transmission of faith from the Western Hemisphere, theology and praxis interacted uneasily. Church leaders often relegated contextual theologization as missiology even as theological taxonomy of the Western world had caricatured non-Western, indigenous contextual theological endeavors as too missiological.<sup>67</sup> Asian voices found themselves submerged under Western ways of expressing the faith. Contextualization is especially challenging among Malaysian Pentecostals, as it is in the rest of Southeast Asia.<sup>68</sup> Malaysian Catholic Pentecostals' use of the language of possession, exorcism, and the name of "Allah" have raised questions of its contradistinction from similar terms used in other religious faiths. These are examples of the challenge of contextualization and inculturation that cuts across renewal movements in Asia.<sup>69</sup> How may local leaders and Western observers receive local theological thought and practice in promising directions started by the Centre for the Study of Christianity in Asia, Trinity Christian College, Singapore's commissioned theological and ecclesiological monographs?<sup>70</sup>

The challenge of theology amid enculturation did not help when local megachurches in Singapore either disregarded theological education (such as is evident in New Creation Church, Singapore) or started their own non-locally-accredited, though international-affiliated, Bible institutes or schools (e.g., City Harvest Church and FCBC's respective program offerings) that maintained differentiated hermeneutics and reading from historic seminary education. Would this proliferation amid currently recognized Pentecostal offerings (e.g., ACTS College, formerly AG Seminary Singapore, TCA College, Tung Ling Bible College) widen the already polarized, local renewal developments, thereby diluting its witness among mainstream evangelical Christianity, whose colleagues are trained in established and newer institutions (e.g., Trinity Theological College, Singapore Bible College, Discipleship Training Centre, Biblical Graduate School of Theology, and Baptist Theological Seminary)? In regards to the place of theological education, the Malaysian Pentecostal movement may experience less fragmentation than what is happening in the much smaller Singaporean island context.

### **Faith formation, seminary, and ecclesial unity**

The reality of splintering or lack of active efforts toward legitimate unity at both fronts is a concern among Pentecostals and charismatics, and between renewal and other Christian traditions, including historic Orthodoxy and the Roman Catholic Church, especially in Singapore. While churches do not live in a bubble, it appears that denominations in Singapore have been slow to keep up with official dialogues and developments between churches at the world and international levels. Denominations in Singapore do not yet have ecumenical officers, and apart from the rare joint commemorations, churches do not actively demonstrate efforts to heal memories or reconcile doctrinal differences. Across the border, interdenominational collaborations among Malaysian churches as well as insights at world Christian levels have much to offer for the ecumenical trajectory of churches in these two countries.

A related issue is that the proliferation of Bible colleges and seminaries in Singaporean churches celebrate diversity and vibrancy of many educational settings for

theological learning. Yet the innumerable institutional setups only speak to the reality of the disunity among churches. Unlike the reality of geographical distance between states in Malaysia, which perhaps warrants the existence of many schools,<sup>71</sup> I wonder how seminary education could more ecumenically and wholistically pull the churches' resources together in equipping leaders and training disciples, instead of the unspoken competition that exists among them in Singapore. I do not denigrate the actuality of target audience service in denominational seminaries such as the Union College consortium of the Trinity Theological College, and the other laity-directed program offerings such as Biblical Graduate School of Theology and Discipleship Training Centre. Also, how would seminaries in Malaysia (no doubt spread thinly by its wide geographical states) speak to the many issues of faith formation and relational development between churches of various denominations and traditions: would the Pentecostal/charismatic ethos promote unity and leadership with mainline churches and other non-renewal evangelical and indigenous churches? It appears that seminaries still keep their turf amid observable collaborations inter-ecclesiastically, claims Catholic Archbishop-elect, Julian Leow.<sup>72</sup>

### **Outreach: evangelism, interreligious engagement, social witness, and the civil space**

Perhaps the most difficult to envision is whether Pentecostals/charismatics can advance the Spirit-empowered mission for evangelism and outreach. After all, many megachurches (planted and blossomed in renewal traditions) are already engaging in state-of-the-art evangelism, mass missional consecration, and mobilization. Church growth in megachurches in Singapore and Malaysia are not merely attributed to transfer growth from other churches (also known as “stealing sheep”) but also due to the robust and creative evangelism to the unchurched and younger generations.<sup>73</sup> Churches have also seen phenomenal increases of support for missions and missionaries. Literally, to a large extent, with the successes of the GoForth Mission Conference the aspiration for “Antioch” has already become a reality well beyond an originally Lausanne-initiated vision for an accelerated outreach in the AD2000 movement (commonly associated with Bill Bright, Billy Graham, Philip Teng, and others).<sup>74</sup> Still, other religions in Asia (including Malaysia and Singapore) continue to regard Christianity as a foreign religion, whose church architecture, beliefs, and liturgy appear to be patterned or expressed consistently with the Christianities of the European traditions.<sup>75</sup>

Apart from evangelism, outreach may also be considered in various aspects: interreligious engagement, social witnessing, and Christian presence in the civil sphere, though the trajectories for Singapore and Malaysia will be different in many respects. Apart from the active Islam dialogue with Christianity in Malaysia, it is perhaps reasonable to acknowledge that there is limited interreligious engagement between Pentecostals and other religions in Singapore.<sup>76</sup> It is not that Christianity or Pentecostalism is not interested in interreligious understanding. Many seminars have been conducted on formulating clear positions of harmonious engagements.<sup>77</sup> What remains unpublicized are official engagements, if any, in light of the various sociopolitical states and realities (briefly described above). For instance, the reality of Islamization in Malaysia remains a challenge.<sup>78</sup> Would interreligious sociality be forged any differently if more of the “closed-doors” sessions between religious groups in both countries were open to public observation?

Further, is religion merely an arena for private practice, and what is the extent of Christianity and discipleship's social and public witness? And is it really possible to

separate or even delineate between the belief and practice of one's faith in the private and public spheres such as is evident in the differentiated practices in Singapore and Malaysia? In Singapore's "state communitarian multiculturalism," Singapore sociologist Goh reminds that, "the state acts as both the guarantor and cultivator of a secular public morality crafted from the wellsprings of the citizens' religious beliefs and values"; consequently, "religious pluralism is not only to be arbitrated, but has to be protected as the very source of the nation's secularity."<sup>79</sup> Yet, in Malaysia, the Islamic statehood, no doubt with a promise for freedom of practice of religion, has been a particular challenge for Islamic-Christian relations, so much so that 2015 World Watch List ranks Malaysian Christianity thirty-seventh on the global persecution index.<sup>80</sup> While both nations vary in their approaches to major and minority religions, the sociopolitical implications of negotiating religious space in the public and private dimensions of life appear similar. Religion not only occurs in the private sphere, but it also carries ramifications for the public sphere.<sup>81</sup> In that sense, Pentecostalism and charismaticism do not operate any differently from the practice of the wider Christian traditions in both countries. The question is: Does the "many tongues of the Spirit" allow more innovative approaches than have yet been seen in the sociopolitical sphere? And how may Christianity, and especially the Pentecostal/charismatic movement, avoid the pitfalls of a prosperity and success-driven spirituality in its witness, which a prominent social theologian, Mark Chan, calls, a "narcissistic spirituality"?<sup>82</sup>

Singaporean and Malaysian Christianity appear to have thrived in social witness, e.g., the realm of non-evangelistic social engagements. The governments have welcomed social contributions of religions, and various Christian groups in Singapore, for instance, have been lauded by the state leaders.<sup>83</sup> One wonders if the public recognition subtly pushes Singaporean Christianity's continual social engagement in ways that unwittingly moderates the evangelistic thrust of the gospel and encourages the emergence of Christianity as a religion in the civil sphere that has to carefully negotiate its presence without expressing any hint of civil disobedience, even if occasionally needed? I am not disregarding the complexity of such public witness and social responsibility, and Christianity's contribution to the ongoing construction and development of public policy, which have been duly pointed out by social scientists, theologians, and pastors.<sup>84</sup> I am merely asking if Singaporean Christianity, as well as Malaysian Christianity in this regard, is more or less limited to the roles prescribed to them, or if such is even necessary for the social harmony and interreligious cohesion that are so badly needed in this region? It is against this larger backdrop that we will need to keep watching how LoveSingapore's ongoing social contributions and attempts to sound out conservative conscience of the public navigates the entrenched secular position of a pluralistic context.

### **Conclusion**

From the early beginnings of renewal Christianity to the present in Malaysia and Singapore, the movement has found pathways for growing the faith amid challenges. While it may be too much to claim that prospects are bright or promising, it would be fair to recognize that the renewal movement stands at a crossroad as it moves into a new era: Will it be continue to shine and open up new frontiers as it had, or will it be become submerged into mainstream evangelical Christianities of Singapore and Malaysia, amid the complexities of private and public spheres of intra-Christian development, interreligious engagement, and religious-sociopolitical involvement? While this essay

does not answer the question definitively, it pulls together some past and present trajectories toward a reimagining of the multidimensionality of Pentecostalism and charismaticism in both lands.<sup>85</sup>

## Notes

1. Some helpful resources: Tan-Chow May Ling, *Pentecostal Theology for the Twenty-First Century* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007); Roger E. Hedlund, "Understanding Southeast Asian Christianity," in Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, ed., *Christian Movements in Southeast Asia* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College and Genesis Books, 2010), 59–100, esp. 73–80 and 89–96; Jin Huat Tan, "Pentecostals and Charismatics in Malaysia and Singapore," in Allan H. Anderson and Edmond Tang, eds., *Asian and Pentecostal*, rev. ed., (Oxford: Regnum, 2011), 227–247; Lana Yiu Lan Khong, *A Study of a Thaumaturgical Charismatic Movement in Singapore*, ed. Michael Nai-Chiu Poon (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2012); and Allan Heaton Anderson, "Pentecostalism and Charismatic Movements in Asia," in Felix Wilfred, ed., *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity in Asia* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 158–70.
2. Cecil M. Robeck Jr., *Azusa Street Revival* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2006).
3. A. H. Anderson, "Pentecostalism in East Asia: Indigenous oriental Christianity?," *Pneuma* 22, no. 1 (2000): 115–132; Young-Hoon Lee, "Korean Pentecost: The Great Revival of 1907," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 4, no. 1 (2001): 73–83; Hwa Yung, "Endued with Power: The Pentecostal/Charismatic Renewal and the Asian Church in the Twenty-First Century," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 6, no. 1 (2003): 63–82, esp. 68–69; and Sung Won Yang, "The Influence of the Revival Movement of 1901–1910 on the Development of Korean Christianity" (PhD diss., Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 2002).
4. Allan Heaton Anderson, *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013); idem, "To All Points of the Compass: The Azusa Street Revival and Global Pentecostalism," *Enrichment Journal* (2006), available online at [http://www.enrichmentjournal.ag.org/200602/200602\\_164\\_AllPoints.cfm](http://www.enrichmentjournal.ag.org/200602/200602_164_AllPoints.cfm); and Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant, and Richard Flory, eds., *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013).
5. Edmund Kee-Fook Chia, "Malaysia and Singapore," in Peter C. Phan, ed., *Christianities in Asia* (Malden, MA: Blackwell-Wiley, 2011), 77–94; Robbie B. H. Goh, *Christianity in Southeast Asia* (Singapore: ISEAS, 2005), 47–56; John Roxborough, *A History of Christianity in Malaysia* (Singapore: Seminari Theoloji Malaysia and Genesis, 2014).
6. Tan, "Pentecostals and Charismatics in Malaysia and Singapore," 227.
7. Although not cited unless quoted from directly, the rest of this section draws extensively from Tan's comprehensive, "Pentecostals and Charismatics in Malaysia and Singapore"; I will provide supplements where necessary.
8. See "The Origin of the CPM Work in Malaysia and Singapore," *Pentecostal Messenger*, April 2001, 8, 20–21; Chris Thomas, *Diaspora Indians* (Penang: MIEC, 1978).
9. Georg Evers, "'On the Trail of Spices': Christianity in Southeast Asia: Common Traits of the Encounters of Christianity with Societies, Cultures, and Religions in Southeast Asia," in Felix Wilfred, ed., *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity in Asia* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 73.
10. Tan-Chow, *Pentecostal Theology*, 18–19.
11. Although there are some indications the seminar took place in 1977, Tan-Chow (*Pentecostal Theology*, 15n4) cites sources saying that the event occurred in 1982.

12. See also Tan Jin-Huat and Ooi Chin Aik, eds., *Pursuit of God's Cause* (Petaling Jaya: National Evangelical Christian Fellowship, 1998), 24.

13. Peter Tan: <http://johannministries.com/site/> and autobiography, *The Road to Glory* (Canberra, Australia: Johann Ministries, 2014), available at <http://spiritword.net/ebooks/The%20Road%20to%20Glory.pdf>; Paul Ang Global Vision: <http://pagv.org.my/>; and David Wong's World Harvest Church, Kuala Lumpur, and GloryWord Seminar (registered in 1988 to operate Ministry Training Institute and Apostolic Program; the school, now known as World Harvest Institute, received its twelfth intake on March 7, 2010): <http://www.worldharvest.org.my/> and <http://psdavidwong.blogspot.com/> (accessed January 6, 2015).

14. JoyChan.Weebly.com, "I Almost Casted the Stone... Actually I Did!," September 28, 2009, <http://joychan.weebly.com/1/post/2009/09/i-almost-casted-the-1st-stoneactually-i-did.html>, and his critics, Victory Ministries, "Pastor Peter Tan—Coming Wars and Worldwide Castrophes," <http://walthope.wordpress.com/tag/peter-tan/> (accessed January 6, 2015).

15. Unlike Tan, Barbara Watson Andaya, "Christianity in Southeast Asia: Similarity and Differences in a Culturally Diverse Region," in Charles E. Farhadian, ed., *Introducing World Christianity* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), 121, claims that Sidang Injil Borneo's prayer movement at Mount Murud in Sarawak is the mountain spirit continuing the veneration of the dead tradition.

16. Jin Huat Tan, *Planting an Indigenous Church: The Case of the Borneo Evangelical Mission* (Oxford: Regnum Books, 2011).

17. Chinese and Hokkien gospel singer cum pastor Lim Gee Tiong, <http://gtlim.com/#about> (accessed January 7, 2015).

18. Judy Berinai, "Liturgical Inculturation in Anglican Worship in light of the Spirituality of the Indigenous People of Sabah, Malaysia" (PhD diss., Oxford Centre for Mission Studies, 2013), 263.

19. National Evangelical Christian Fellowship Malaysia, "Membership," <http://www.necf.org.my/index.cfm?&menuid=7> (accessed January 6, 2015).

20. ChristianityMalaysia.com "Celebrating God's Goodness!—Malaysian CARE 35th Anniversary and Thanksgiving," September 17, 2014, <http://christianitymalaysia.com/wp/celebrating-gods-goodness-malaysian-care-35th-anniversary-thanksgiving/> (accessed April 4, 2015).

21. E.g., Kar Yong, NT lecturer in Seminari Theologi Malaysia: "Response to Rev Won Kim Kong's Statement," <http://myhomilia.blogspot.com/2008/09/response-to-rev-wong-kim-kongs.html> (accessed April 4, 2015).

22. Leadership Transformation Academy, <http://www.wongkimkong.com/index.cfm?&menuid=21> (accessed January 6, 2015).

23. Ong Sek Leang, "Response from Rev. Ong Sek Leang, Senior Pastor of Metro Tabernacle Church," July, 1, 2013, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yNUnjPG-6c8>; idem, "Welcome Message from PWC Host Chairman, 23<sup>rd</sup> Pentecostal World Conference," June 26, 2013, <http://www.pwc2013.org/welcome-pwc.html>.

24. "Christians Persecuted in Malaysia," January 4, 2014, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UkjGkeO1OOE>; Krisis and Praxis, "The Beginning of Persecution of Christian Minorities in Malaysia?," January 3, 2014, <http://www.krisispraxis.com/archives/2014/01/the-beginning-of-persecution-of-christian-minorities-in-malaysia/> (accessed April 4, 2015).

25. Robbie B. H. Goh, *Christianity in Southeast Asia* (Singapore: ISEAS, 2005), 35–46; Bobby E. K. Sng, *In His Good Times* (Singapore: Bible Society of Singapore, 2003), esp. 37–38, 133–137. In Singapore, Anglicans are regarded as Protestants although English Reformation differs from the European Protestant Reformation and the Radical Reformers' development.

26. Daniel P. S. Goh, "State and Social Christianity in Post-Colonial Singapore," *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 25, no. 1 (2010): 54.
27. I draw variously in the next two paragraphs on Tan-Chow, *Pentecostal Theology*, 18–19.
28. Singapore Pentecostal churches abbreviated as AG instead of Malaysian Pentecostal use, AOG.
29. Tan, "Pentecostals and Charismatics in Malaysia and Singapore," 233.
30. Tung Ling Bible School Board of Directors, <http://www.tungling.org.sg/our-people/> (accessed January 8, 2015).
31. Khong, *Study of a Thaumaturgical Charismatic Movement*, 28–31, traced the charismatic renewal to American attorney-turned-evangelist Herbert Mjorud to the Lutheran missionaries, the Anglican Church, and the Roman Catholics; see also Michael Poon and Malcom Tan, eds., *The Clock Tower Story* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2011).
32. James Wong, "A Pioneer's Reflection," November 1, 2008, <http://www.tungling.org.sg/a-pioneers-reflection-canon-james-wong/> (accessed January 8, 2015).
33. Tan-Chow, *Pentecostal Theology*, 20n16, citing from T. R. Doraisamy, ed., *Forever Beginning* (Singapore: The Methodist Church in Singapore, 1985), 135.
34. "What Is Pentecostalism?," <http://www.methodist.org.sg/~methodis/index.php/home/public-square/1179-what-is-pentecostalism> (accessed January 8, 2015).
35. Tan, "Pentecostals and Charismatics in Malaysia and Singapore," 241; Jeffrey Tsang and Susan Tsang, *Acts of the Holy Spirit at Church of Our Saviour* (Singapore: Armour Publishing, 2012), 15–16. Professor Khoo Oon Teik, founder of the National Kidney Foundation, Singapore, and who established nephrology in Singapore General Hospital, also experienced the charismatic touch while attending The Methodist Church in Singapore. See Alvin Chua, "Khoo Oon Teik," *SingaporeInfopedia*, [http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP\\_1558\\_2009-08-29.html](http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP_1558_2009-08-29.html) (accessed January 8, 2015).
36. Tan-Chow, *Pentecostal Theology*, 19; Tsang and Tsang, *Acts of the Holy Spirit*, 15–16, 23–26; Daniel P. S. Goh, "Pluralist Secularism and the Displacements of Christian Proselytizing in Singapore," in Juliana Finucane and R. Michael Feener, eds., *Proselytizing and the Limits of Religious Pluralism in Contemporary Asia* (Singapore: Springer Science+Business Media Singapore, 2014), 125–146, at 137; Michael J. McClymond, "Charismatic Renewal and Neo-Pentecostalism: From North American Origins to Global Permutations," in Cecil M. Robeck Jr. and Amos Yong, eds., *The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 39.
37. Tsang and Tsang, *Acts of the Holy Spirit*, 15–16, 26–29, 33.
38. "Festival of Praise," [http://www.guidinglight.com/encyclopedia/F/Festival\\_of\\_Praise/](http://www.guidinglight.com/encyclopedia/F/Festival_of_Praise/) (accessed January 8, 2015).
39. This is notwithstanding Bishop Chew's claim that Anglicanism has more in common with Pentecostals than with the progressive ethos of the Church of England. See Laurie Thompson, "A Model of Reciprocity in Anglicanism: The Consecration and Enthronement of the Revd. Dr. John Chew Hiang Chea, April 25, 2000 at St. Andrews' Cathedral, Singapore," *Anglican and Episcopal History* 70, no. 4 (2001): 527–532.
40. LSBC, <http://www.lsb.org.sg/about-us/>; BBTC: <http://bbtc.com.sg/history/> (accessed January 9, 2015). I have excluded Bethesda Cathedral since its charismatic ethos is not normally perceived as aligned with members churches of the Brethren Network Fellowship, Singapore. Also, one has to wonder, would it be possible for the Church of Singapore (formerly Brethren in its roots) to rekindle fellowship with the Brethren, some of whom have become more welcoming of moderate charismatic renewal?
41. Church of the Nativity of the Blessed Virgin Mary, "Charismatic Renewal Movement," [http://nativitychurchsingapore.org/?page\\_id=745](http://nativitychurchsingapore.org/?page_id=745) (accessed January 8, 2015).

Khong, *Study of a Thaumaturgical Charismatic Movement*, 29–30, claims Anglican influence on Catholic charismatic renewal.

42. Church of the Nativity of the Blessed Virgin Mary, “Charismatic Renewal Movement”; The Burning Bush, “About the Burning Bush Charismatic Prayer Group,” <http://www.burningbush.sg/about/index.htm> (accessed January 8, 2015).

43. Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Singapore, “Archdiocesan Catholic Council for Ecumenical Dialogue (ACCED),” [http://www.veritas.org.sg/catholic\\_directory\\_group\\_detail.php?GroupID=327&TypeDesc=Commissions&pageTitle=Archdiocesan%20Catholic%20Council%20for%20Ecumenical%20Dialogue%20](http://www.veritas.org.sg/catholic_directory_group_detail.php?GroupID=327&TypeDesc=Commissions&pageTitle=Archdiocesan%20Catholic%20Council%20for%20Ecumenical%20Dialogue%20) (accessed January 8, 2015). Methodist André de Winne’s “An Underlying Intolerance,” observed this bigotry from his encounter with Singapore Protestants: “An Underlying Intolerance,” July 3, 2013, <http://methodist.org.sg/index.php/home/public-square/1338-an-underlying-intolerance> (accessed January 9, 2015).

44. CBCP News, “Singapore Catholics, Protestants Jointly Hold Healing Service,” October 25, 2014, <http://www.cbcnews.com/cbcnews/?p=43986> (accessed January 8, 2015).

45. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements,” 133.

46. New Creation Church, “Factsheet on New Creation Church’s Business Entities,” August 26, 2014, <http://r.newcreation.org.sg/storage/factsheet.pdf> (accessed January 9, 2015).

47. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements,” 130–132; Khong, *Study of a Thaumaturgical Charismatic Movement*, 44–45.

48. Terence Chong, “Christian, Evangelicals and Public Morality in Singapore,” *ISEAS Perspective* 17 (March 17, 2014): 1–11; Khong was responding to the progressive proposals like Kenneth Paul Tan and Gary Jack Jin Lee, “Imagining the Gay Community in Singapore,” *Critical Asian Studies* 39, no. 2 (2007): 179–204.

49. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements,” 131.

50. Jean DeBernardi, “Asia’s Antioch: Prayer and Proselytism in Singapore,” in Rosalind I. J. Hackett, ed., *Proselytization Revisited* (London: Equinox, 2008), 279.

51. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements,” 134–136; *The Straits Times*, “Trial of City Harvest Church Leaders Resumes,” [http://www.straitstimes.com/chc\\_funds\\_case](http://www.straitstimes.com/chc_funds_case) (accessed January 9, 2015). See also CHC Special Notices, <http://www.chc.org.sg/#!/special-notice/> and <http://www.chc.org.sg/#!/chc-dna/> (accessed 9 January 2015).

52. Rivers of Life Ministry, Ltd., College of Prophets, <http://gallery.mailchimp.com/9ca6d4dbf5b7fda1d2742cced/files/Prospectus.3.pdf> (accessed January 6, 2015). These former Malaysian pastors include Rev. Dr. Steven Francis, Rev. Dr. Roy Muttiah (Cornerstone Glory Church), and Rev. Dr. Collin Gordon (Trinity Community Centre, Petaling Jaya).

53. GoForth brings together largely evangelical mission bodies such as Crus (formerly Campus Crusade for Christ), HealthServe, Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, Interserve, Operations Mobilization (OM), ORTV, Overseas Missionary Fellowship (OMF), Southeast Asia Unreached People Groups Network (SEALINK), SEANET, SIM, TWR-Asia, Wycliffe Bible Translators, and many other organizations as part of the “National Missions Movement in Singapore,” <http://www.goforth.org.sg/index.php/en/about-goforth1> (accessed January 9, 2015).

54. Statue in the Singapore Government, Attorney General’s Chambers, July 31, 2011, <http://statutes.agc.gov.sg/aol/search/display/view.w3p?page=0;query=DocId%3A77026343-e30d-40e2-a32e-b1f5d46c5bd7%20%20Status%3Ainforce%20Depth%3A0;rec=0;whole=yes> (accessed January 9, 2015).

55. “International Religious Freedom Report for 2011” and “2012,” US Department of State, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor, <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/192873.pdf> and <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/208476.pdf> (accessed January 9, 2015).

56. Still awaiting the Asia and Europe in a Global Context forum B21 report on “Transcultural Dynamics of Pentecostalism: Pentecostal Christianity between Globalization and Localized Spheres in Singapore and the Straits,” led by Katja Rakow, and supported by Esther Naemi Rebekka Berg and Matthias Deininger; see Cluster of Excellence: Asia and Europe in a Global Context, “B21 Transcultural Dynamics of Pentecostalism,” <http://www.asia-europe.uni-heidelberg.de/en/research/b-public-spheres/b21-transcultural-dynamics-of-Pentecostalism.html> (accessed January 8, 2015).

57. Richard Magnus, “The Christian Role in a Pluralistic Society, with Specific Reference to Singapore,” in Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, ed., *Pilgrims and Citizens* (Adelaide: ATF Press, 2006), 169–178; Roland Chia, “Christian Witness in the Public Square: Retrospection and Prospection,” in Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, ed., *Engaging Society* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2013), 133–150.

58. Terence Chong, “Filling the Moral Void: The Christian Right and the State in Singapore,” *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 41, no. 4 (2011): 566–583; Terence Chong and Yew-Foong Hui, *Different Under God* (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2013).

59. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements,” 138.

60. Gerard Jacobs, *The Pursuit and Acquisition of Health and Wealth* (Christchurch: Wisebuys NZ Books, 2006); Johnson T.K. Lim, *Health and Wealth Gospel* (Singapore: FaithNWorks, 2009).

61. This matter is the subject of Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and Displacements.”

62. Sng, *In His Good Times*, 202–204; Anonymous, “Fundamentalism in Singapore,” unpublished paper, 4, 6–9, <http://www.calvarypandan.sg/images/CBS/History%20of%20Fundamentalism%20in%20Singapore.pdf> (accessed January 9, 2015). Other related literature can be found at <http://www.calvarypandan.sg/other-seminarstalks>.

63. Simon Chan, “LoveSingapore—Stone Soup? Review of May Ling Tan-Chow, *Pentecostal Theology for the Twenty-First Century*,” *H-Pentecostalism*, December 2007, <http://www.h-net.org/reviews/showrev.php?id=13966> (accessed January 9, 2015).

64. “Amazing Holy Spirit in Singapore!!,” February 2, 2012, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iH\\_d\\_ktnKW4](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iH_d_ktnKW4); “Pentecostalism in Singapore—Megachurches and Contemporary Christianity,” September 19, 2013, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fx2qlG8UBhM> (accessed February 1, 2015).

65. Johnson T. K. Lim, ed., *Holy Spirit* (Singapore: Word N Works, 2015).

66. Terence Chong and Daniel P. S. Goh, “Asian Pentecostalism,” in Bryan S. Turner and Oscar Salemink, eds., *Routledge Handbook of Religions in Asia* (New York: Routledge, 2015), 412–415.

67. Yung, *Mangoes or Bananas? The Quest for an Authentic Asian Christian Theology* (Oxford: Regnum International, 1997).

68. Barbara Watson Andaya, “Contextualizing the Global: Exploring the Roots of Pentecostalism in Malaysia and Indonesia,” paper presented at the Management and Marketing of Global Religions symposium at the National Museum of Ethnology, August 11–14, 2009, available online at [http://www.360doc.com/content/14/0715/17/11096586\\_394607353.shtml](http://www.360doc.com/content/14/0715/17/11096586_394607353.shtml) (accessed February 1, 2014).

69. S. E. Ackerman, “The Language of Religious Innovation: Spirit Possession and Exorcism in a Malaysian Catholic Pentecostal Movement,” *Journal of Anthropological Research* 37, no. 1 (1981): 90–100; idem, “Experimentation and Renewal among Malaysian Christians: Charismatic Movement in Kuala Lumpur and Petaling Jaya,” *Asian Journal of Social Science* 12 no. 12 (1984): 35–48; Chia, “Malaysia and Singapore,” 84–87; Ida Lim, “Three Things We Learned From Malaysia’s ‘Allah’ Case,” *MalaymailOnline*, January 25, 2015, <http://www.themalaymailonline.com/malaysia/article/three-things-we-learned-from-malaysia-allah-case> (accessed February 3, 2015).

70. Trinity Theological College, “Centre for the Study of Christianity in Asia,” <http://www.ttc.edu.sg/academics/centres/csca/> (accessed February 1, 2015).
71. However, Tan Kong Beng, “Leadership Formation and Training in Malaysia,” in Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, ed., *Church Partnerships in Asia* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2011), 169–177, sees the many seminaries in Malaysia as an unproductive overstretching of the churches’ resources.
72. *Herald Malaysia Online*, “Looking Towards the Future With Hope,” August 14, 2014, <http://www.heraldmalaysia.com/newscategory/news/Looking-towards-the-future-with-hope/20486/5/> (accessed February 1, 2015).
73. There are contesting reports: “Church Growth in Singapore,” November 2, 2013, <http://singaporereligion.com/>; or eleven-part article on megachurch growth in Singapore, July 17, 2010, <http://junmingumich.blogspot.com/2010/07/many-recent-articles-on-churches-in.html> (accessed February 1, 2015).
74. Luis Bush, “The Unfinished Task: It Can Be Done,” AD2000.org, <http://www.ad2000.org/tut0701.htm> (accessed February 1, 2015).
75. Chia, “Malaysia and Singapore,” 82–83. I am not negating that some forms of localized worship are observable in Singapore and Malaysia megachurches.
76. Some of Islam-Christian dialogue in Malaysia amid the nation’s sensitive interreligious and governmental approaches have been analyzed by a rising Presbyterian observer in Singapore: Sze Zeng, “About,” <http://szezeng.blogspot.com/p/about-me.html> (accessed February 2, 2015).
77. For instance, see Roland Chia, “Preserving Religious Peace in Multi-religious Singapore,” paper presented at the Ethos Institute for Public Christianity of the National Council of Churches Singapore, Trinity Theological College Singapore and The Bible Society of Singapore, December 16, 2014, available at <http://ethosinstitute.sg/preserving-religious-peace-in-multi-religious-singapore/> (accessed February 2, 2015).
78. Chia, “Malaysia and Singapore,” 85–87.
79. Goh, “Pluralist Secularism and the Displacements,” 126.
80. Open Doors, “2015 World Watch List,” <https://www.opendoorsusa.org/christian-persecution/world-watch-list/> (accessed February 2, 2015).
81. Li Ann Thio, “Religion in the Public Sphere of Singapore: Wall of Division or Public Square,” in Wade Roof Clark, ed., *Religious Pluralism and Civil Society* (Oxford: Bardwell Press, 2008), 73–104.
82. Mark Chan, “Narcissistic Spirituality and Its Impact on Christian Public Engagement,” in Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, ed., *Engaging Society* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2013), 83–97.
83. Michael Nai-Chiu Poon, *Religion and Governance for Social Harmony in Singapore* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2012); Leong Weng Kam, “PM Lee Lauds Methodist Church’s Contributions to Singapore,” October 31, 2014, <http://www.methodist.org.sg/index.php/home/special-feature/1191-pm-lee-lauds-methodist-churchs-contributions-to-singapore> (accessed February 2, 2015).
84. Poon, ed., *Engaging Society*, especially essays by Daniel Koh, “Middle Axioms and Social Engagement in a Plural Society,” and Roland Chia, “Christian Witness in the Public Square: Retrospection and Prospection,” chapters 6 and 7 respectively; cf. Daniel Kok and Kiem-Kiok Kwa, eds., *Issues of Law and Justice in Singapore* (Singapore: Armour Publishing, 2009).
85. My appreciation to Ms. Esther Ng Ailey for proofreading the original draft, and to Professors Vinson Synan and Amos Yong for this invitation to write for churches in my country of origin.

